Results from "Help Us Protect the Carnegie Mellon Community from Identity Theft" study A Real-Word Evaluation of Anti-Phishing Training

Mary Ann Blair Lorrie Faith Cranor Ponnurangam Kumaraguru (PK)

Joint work with Justin Cranshaw, Alessandro Acquisti, Jason Hong, and Theodore Pham



Outline

- Motivation for collaboration
- Phishing 101
- PhishGuru
- CMU-PhishGuru study design and results
- How to protect yourself
- Lessons learned



Motivation for collaboration

<u>Security Alert - Fraud Emails - CARNEGIE MELLON UNIVERSITY INTERNET USER</u> (Posted September 29, 2008)



Fraud emails have recently been sent to Carnegie Mellon email accounts

claiming to be from *Carnegie Mellon University <cmu@webmaster.com>*. The fraud messages ask people to reply with their *Full Name, User Id, and Password*. **PLEASE ENABLE SPAM FILTERING AND DO NOT REPLY!** For What You Need To Do, see Security Alert - Fraud Emails - CARNEGIE MELLON

UNIVERSITY INTERNET USE.

www.cmu.edu/iso

Motivation for collaboration

Security Alert - Fraud Emails - andrew.cmu.edu Feature Release: Upgraded Search (Posted August 27, 2008)



Fraud emails have recently been sent to Carnegie Mellon email accounts

claiming to be from *memberservice* @andrew.cmu.edu. The fraud messages ask people to reply with their User ID and Password. **PLEASE ENABLE SPAM FILTERING AND DO NOT REPLY!**

For What You Need To Do, see <u>Security Alert - Fraud Emails - andrew.cmu.edu Feature</u> <u>Release: Upgraded Search</u>.

www.cmu.edu/iso

Motivation for collaboration

- Reduce risk
 - identity theft
 - credential stealing
 - data leakage
- Improve operational effectiveness
- Support research
- Help individuals avoid being scammed



Phishing 101



To: isri-people@cs.cmu.edu

Cc:

Subject: eBay: urgent security notice [Sun, 05 Feb 2006 18:54:02 -0400]



Dear eBay Member,

We regret to inform you that your eBay account could be suspended if you don't re-update your account information.

To resolve this problem please visit link below and re-enter your account information:

https://signin.ebay.com/ws/eBayISAP1.dll&SignIn&sid=verify&co_partnerId=2&siteid=0

If your problems could not be resolved your account will be suspended for a period of 24 hours, after this period your account will be terminated.

For the User Agreement, Section 9, we may immediately issue a warning, temporarily suspend, indefinitely suspend or terminate your membership and refuse to provide our services to you if we believe that your actions may cause financial loss or legal liability for you, our users or us. We may also take these actions if we are unable to verify or authenticate any information you provide to us.

Due to the suspension of this account, please be advised you are prohibited from using eBay in any way. This includes the registering of a new account. Please note that this suspension does not relieve you of your agreed-upon obligation to pay any fees you may owe to eBay.

To: isri-people@cs.cmu.edu

eBay: Urgent Notification From Billing Department



Dear eBay Member,

We regret to inform you that your eBay account could be suspended if you don't re-update your account information.

To resolve this problem please visit link below and re-enter your account information:

https://signin.ebay.com/ws/eBayISAP1.dll&SignIn&sid=verify&co_partnerId=2&siteid=0

If your problems could not be resolved your account will be suspended for a period of 24 hours, after this period your account will be terminated.

For the User Agreement, Section 9, we may immediately issue a warning, temporarily suspend, indefinitely suspend or terminate your membership and refuse to provide our services to you if we believe that your actions may cause financial loss or legal liability for you, our users or us. We may also take these actions if we are unable to verify or authenticate any information you provide to us.

Due to the suspension of this account, please be advised you are prohibited from using eBay in any way. This includes the registering of a new account. Please note that this suspension does not relieve you of your agreed-upon obligation to pay any fees you may owe to eBay.

Sent: Sun 2/5/2006 6:03 PM

To: isri-people@cs.cmu.edu

Cc:

Subject: eBay: urgent security notice [Sun, 05 Feb 2006 18:54:02 -0400]



Dear eBay Member,

We regret to inform you that your eBay account could be suspended if you don't re-update your account information.

https://signin.ebay.com/ws/eBayISAP1.dll&SignIn&sid=verify&co_partnerId=2&siteid=0

If your problems could not be resolved your account will be suspended for a period of 24 hours, after this period your account will be terminated.

For the User Agreement, Section 9, we may immediately issue a warning, temporarily suspend, indefinitely suspend or terminate your membership and refuse to provide our services to you if we believe that your actions may cause financial loss or legal liability for you, our users or us. We may also take these actions if we are unable to verify or authenticate any information you provide to us.

Due to the suspension of this account, please be advised you are prohibited from using eBay in any way. This includes the registering of a new account. Please note that this suspension does not relieve you of your agreed-upon obligation to pay any fees you may owe to eBay.

Sent: Sun 2/5/2006 6:03 PM

To: isri-people@cs.cmu.edu

Cc:

Subject: eBay: urgent security notice [Sun, 05 Feb 2006 18:54:02 -0400]



Dear eBay Member,

We regret to inform you that your eBay account could be suspended if you don't re-update your account information.

To resolve this problem please visit link below and relepter your account information:

https://signin.ebay.com/ws/eBayISAPI.dll?SignIn&sid=verify&c o_partnerid=2&sidteid=0

In your problems could not be resolved your account will be suspended for a penod of 24 mours, after this period your account will be terminated.

For the User Agreement, Section 9, we may immediately issue a warning, temporarily suspend, indefinitely suspend or terminate your membership and refuse to provide our services to you if we believe that your actions may cause financial loss or legal liability for you, our users or us. We may also take these actions if we are unable to verify or authenticate any information you provide to us.

Due to the suspension of this account, please be advised you are prohibited from using eBay in any way. This includes the registering of a new account. Please note that this suspension does not relieve you of your agreed-upon obligation to pay any fees you may owe to eBay.



Phishing works

- 73 million US adults received more than 50 phishing emails each in the year 2005
- Gartner estimated 3.6 million adults lost \$3.2 billion in phishing attacks in 2007
- Financial institutions and military are also victims
- Corporate espionage





Why phishing works

- Phishers take advantage of Internet users' trust in legitimate organizations
- Lack of computer and security knowledge [Dhamija et al.]
- People don't use good strategies to protect themselves [Downs et al.]



Anti-phishing strategies

- Silently eliminate the threat
 - Find and take down phishing web sites
 - Detect and delete phishing emails
- Warn users about the threat
 - Anti-phishing toolbars and web browser features
- Train users not to fall for attacks



User education is challenging

- For most users, security is a secondary task
- It is difficult to teach people to make the right online trust decision without increasing their false positive errors



Is user education possible?

Security education "puts the burden on the wrong shoulder."

[Nielsen, J. 2004. User education is not the answer to security problems. http://www.useit.com/alertbox/20041025.html.]

 "Security user education is a myth."
[Gorling, S. 2006. The myth of user education. In Proceedings of the 16th Virus Bulletin International Conference.]

 "User education is a complete waste of time. It is about as much use as nailing jelly to a wall.... They are not interested...they just want to do their job."
[Martin Overton, a U.K.-based security specialist at IBM, quoted in

http://news.cnet.com/2100-7350_3-6125213-2.html]







Web site training study

- Laboratory study of 28 non-expert computer users
- Control group: evaluate 10 sites, 15 minute break to read email or play solitaire, evaluate 10 more sites
- Experimental group: evaluate 10 sites, 15 minutes to read web-based training materials, evaluate 10 more sites
- Experimental group performed significantly better identifying phish after training
 - But they had more false positives
- People can learn from web-based training materials, if only we could get them to read them!
- P. Kumaraguru, S. Sheng, A. Acquisti, L. Cranor, and J. Hong. Teaching Johnny Not to Fall for Phish. CyLab Technical Report CMU-CyLab-07003, 2007.



PhishGuru





PhishGuru Embedded Training

- Can we "train" people during their normal use of email to avoid phishing attacks?
 - Periodically, people receive a training email
 - Training email looks like a phishing attack
 - If a person falls for it, intervention warns and highlights what cues to look for in succinct and engaging format
- Motivating users "teachable moment"
- Applies learning science principles for designing training interventions

000		Squi	rrelMail 1.4.5	-		
) 🗙 🍙 👎 http://err.	cylab.cmu.edu/m	ail/src/webmail.php	☆ ▼) ° (G ▼ just-in time traiQ)		
Most Visited 👻 Squ	irrelMail 1.5.1 EDAS Conference M	a Carnegie M	ellon Dir APWG EMAILS FEATU	Conference on Email » Linked in v		
Folders	Current Folder: INBOX Sign Out					
Last Refresh: Tue, 2:39 pm (<u>Check mail</u>)	Compose Addresses Folders	Options Sear	<u>ch</u> <u>Help</u>	<u>SquirrelMail</u>		
INBOX (1)	Toggle All			Viewing Messages: 1 to 16 (16 total)		
INBOX.Drafts	Move Selected To:			Transform Selected Messages:		
INBOX.Sent INBOX Trash	INBOX.Trash + Move Forward			(Read) Unread (Delete)		
indom.mash	From	Date 🔻	Subject 🗆			
	🔁 Jesse Smith	Apr 11, 2006	Will pick you up in 90 minutes			
	🔲 Joseph Dicosta	Apr 11, 2006	tomorrow's meeting reschedule	<u>ed</u>		
	🕞 Brandy Anderson	Apr 11, 2006	Re: tomorrow's meeting resche	eduled ?		
Subject: Revision to Your Amazon.com Information						
	□ Ni Cheng	Apr 11, 2006	Paragraph to check			
	julie@cognix.com	Apr 11, 2006	great article			
	Ni Cheng	Apr 11, 2006	[cognix-marketing] REMINDE	CR: Power Shut-Down This Satu		
	Brandy Anderson	Apr 11, 2006	Welcome Jennifer to email			
	📄 hamza sani	Apr 11, 2006	REPLY QUICKLY PLEASE			
	🗆 Jean Williams	Apr 11, 2006	+ <u>cool pic</u>			
	Security Advisor	Apr 11, 2006	Update your account informat	ion		
	🗆 Ni Cheng	Apr 11, 2006	[cognix-marketing] Dinner me	nu selection - Annual		
	service@paypal.com	Apr 11, 2006	Reactivate Your PayPal Accou	<u>nt!</u>		
	🗆 Jean Williams	Apr 11, 2006	Re: Funny joke (fwd)			
	📃 Fiona Jones	Apr 11, 2006	Don't forget mom's birthday!			
	Toggle All			Viewing Messages: 1 to 16 (16 total)		



Done



Laboratory study results

- Security notices are an ineffective medium for training users
- Users educated with embedded training make better decisions than those sent security notices
- Participants retained knowledge after 7 days
- Training does not increase false positive error



Real world study: Portuguese ISP

- PhishGuru is effective in training people in the real world
 - Statistically significant difference between Day 0 and Day 2 in both generic and spear conditions (p-value < 0.05)
- Trained participants retained knowledge after 7 days of training
 - No significant difference in generic or spear conditions between Day 2 and Day 7

Kumaraguru, P., Sheng, S., Acquisti, A., Cranor, L. F., and Hong, J. Lessons from a real world evaluation of anti-phishing training. e-Crime Researchers Summit, 2008



CMU-PhishGuru study design and results



CMU study

- Evaluate effectiveness of PhishGuru training in the real world
- Investigate retention after 1 week, 2 weeks, and 4 weeks
- Compare effectiveness of 2 training messages with effectiveness of 1 training message

P. Kumaraguru, J. Cranshaw, A. Acquisti, L. Cranor, J. Hong, M. A. Blair, and T. Pham. School of Phish: A Real-World Evaluation of Anti-Phishing Training. 2009. Under review. http://www.cylab.cmu.edu/research/techreports/cmucylab09002.pdf



Study design

- Sent email to all CMU students, faculty and staff to recruit participants to opt-in to study
- 515 participants in three conditions
 - Control
 - One training message
 - Two training messages
- Emails sent over 28 day period
 - 7 simulated spear-phishing messages
 - 3 legitimate messages from ISO (cyber security scavenger hunt)
- Counterbalanced emails and interventions
- Exit survey



Implementation

- Unique hash in the URL for each participant
- Demographic and department/status data linked to each hash
- Form does not POST login details
- Websites fully functional
- Campus help desks and all spoofed organizations were notified before messages were sent



Study schedule

Day of the study	Control	One training message	Two training messages
Day 0	Test and real	Train and real	Train and real
Day 2		Test	
Day 7		Test and real	
Day 14	Test	Test	Train
Day 16		Test	
Day 21		Test	
Day 28		Test and real	
Day 35		Post-study survey	



Simulated spear phishing message

From: Help Desk <alert-password@cmu.edu>

Subject: Your Andrew password alert

Date: November 17, 2008 11:08:19 AM EST

To: Ponnurangam Kumaraguru (PK)

Plain text email without graphics

Dear Student/Faculty/Staff,

Our records indicate that you have not changed your Andrew password in the last 90 days, if you do not change your password in the next 5 days, your access to the Andrew email system will be terminated. Click the link below to update your password.

http://andrewwebmail.org/password/change.htm?ID=9009

Sincerely, Andrew Help Desk URL is not hidden



Simulated phishing website

Carneg	ABOUT
	WebISO Secure Login
	The resource you requested requires you to authenticate.
	User ID @ ANDREW.CMU.EDU \$
	Old password
	New password
	Confirm password
	Carnegie Mellon Certificates: Many of the services that use WebISO also use the Carnegie Mellon Certificates. If you haven't already done so, you should install the Carnegie Mellon CA Root Certificates in your browser.
	About this service. WebISO verifies the identity of Carnegie Mellon users. WebISO does not require installation of specialized software. However, your browser must be configured to accept cookies. This is the default configuration for all major web browsers. If you have disabled cookies in the past you will need to enable cookie support in your browser to use WebISO [more]

Carnegie Mellon

Simulated phishing website





PhishGuru intervention





Simulated phishing emails

From	Subject line
Info Sec	Bandwidth Quota Offer
Networking Services	Register for Carnegie Mellon's annual networking event
Webmaster	Change Andrew password
The Hub - Enrollment Services	Congratulation - Plaid Ca\$h
Sophie Jones	Please register for the conference
Community Service	Volunteer at Community Service Links
Help Desk	Your Andrew password alert


Results

- People trained with PhishGuru were less likely to click on phishing links than those not trained
- People retained their training for 28 days
- Two training messages are better than one
- PhishGuru training does not make people less likely to click on legitimate links



Effect of PhishGuru

Condition	Ν	% who clicked on Day 0	% who clicked on Day 28
Control	172	52.3	44.2
Trained	343	48.4	24.5



Results conditioned on participants who clicked on day 0





Results conditioned on participants who clicked on day 0



Results conditioned on participants who clicked on day 0 and day 14



Carnegie Mellon

Two-train participants less likely than one-train participants to click on days 16 and 21

Results conditioned on participants who clicked on day 0 and day 14



Two-train participants less likely than one-train participants to click on days 16 and 21

Two-train participants less likely than one-train participants to provide information on day 28

Legitimate emails

Condition	N	Day 0		Day 7	Day 28
		Clicke	d %	Clicked %	Clicked %
Control	90	50.0		41.1	38.9
One-train	89	39.3		42.7	32.3
Two-train	77	48.1		44.2	35.1

No difference between the three conditions on day 0, 7, and 28



Legitimate emails

Condition	N	Day 0	Day 7	Day 28
		Clicked %	Clicked %	Clicked %
Control 90		50.0	41.1	38.9
One-train	89	39.3	42.7	32.3
Two-train	77	48.1	44.2	35.1

No difference between the three conditions on day 0, 7, and 28

No difference within the three conditions for the three emails

Students are most vulnerable

- Students significantly more likely to fall for phish than staff before training
- No significant differences based on student year, department, or gender
- 18-25 age group were consistently more vulnerable to phishing attacks on all days of the study than older participants



Percentage who clicked by age group

Age group	Day 0
18-25	62%
26-35	48%
36-45	33%
45 and older	43%



Inquiries received

- 263 inquiries to ISO/helpdesk
- Most of the users identified it as phish and reported about the email
- Some participants did not identify the emails as phish
 - Some of them attempted to follow the link



Personal emails received

- 39 emails to Lorrie/PK
 - Identifying the emails as phishing emails
 - Checking whether the emails were phishing
 - Thanking for teaching them to identify phishing emails
 - Other system administrators keep us in loop



Most participants liked training, wanted more

- 280 complete post study responses
- 80% recommended that CMU continue PhishGuru training
 - "I really liked the idea of sending CMU students fake phishing emails and then saying to them, essentially, HEY! You could've just gotten scammed! You should be more careful - here's how...."
 - "I think the idea of using something fun, like a cartoon, to teach people about a serious subject is awesome!"



Study conclusion

- Users retained knowledge even 28 days
- Users who saw the training intervention twice did better than those who saw the intervention once
- Users read the emails within 8 hours of the time the email was sent
- Younger users are more vulnerable to phishing than older users





Research to reality

- PhishGuru commercialized
- Co-founded by faculty at CMU
 - Dr. Lorrie Cranor
 - Dr. Jason Hong
 - Dr. Norman Sadeh





How to protect yourself



Don't trust links in an email







Never give out personal information upon email request





Look carefully at the web address





Type in the real website address into a web browser





Don't call company phone numbers in emails or instant messages





Don't open unexpected email attachments or instant message download links





Lessons learned



Lessons learned (on community)

- The community is very supportive
- The ISO didn't undermine its community standing
- There are more helpers than help centers
- We've got some detectives in our midst
- Some people are more behind on their email than me



Lessons learned (on phishing)

- Age matters
- Layered defenses are important but the enduser is still the final defender and they can be duped into divulging their credentials by a well-crafted phishing attack
- Just-in-time training and awareness
 - Make it 'useable': timely, relevant, unavoidable, and fun
- Lather, rinse, repeat

Lessons learned (on research)

- Answering one question leads to two more
- Research is real work, partnership makes it fun



Acknowledgements

- All participants
- System administrators around the campus
- Campus Help Centers
- Departments that we spoofed
- Members of CUPS





CyLab Usable Privacy and Security Laboratory

http://www.cups.cs.cmu.edu/

Learn how to protect yourself from phishing attacks.

http://phishguru.org/

Backup slides







nformation and mon



Done



Done



Phishing

Clicking on links like the one in the email you've just read puts you at risk for identity theft and financial loss. Such emails are called phishing scams.



To learn more about protecting yourself from phishing scams and play an anti-phishing game visit http://phishguru.cs.cmu.edu.
Carnegie Mellon The PhishGuru Protect yourself from Phishing Scams



WARNING!

Clicking on links like the one in the email you've just read puts you at risk for identity theft. A phishing scam uses fraudulent email and web pages to steal bank account information, passwords, and other confidential information.



