# Advisor Feedback from Annual Review Discussion

**Note that the student needs to receive a copy of this completed feedback from the advisor at or prior to their 1-1 feedback discussion.**

Both faculty members and students are encouraged to talk with a GPC member if they would like advice or input for this discussion.

# Student: Year in Ph.D. Program:

**Advisor(s): Date of Feedback Meeting:**

INSTRUCTIONS: Please use this chart to provide an overall assessment of your student’s core skills and progress toward the Ph.D. objectives. Check or make a note (e.g. “very good” or “much improved”) in the box for the most appropriate description of his/her skills relative to peers at the same stage of their graduate career. **An advisor with any significant concerns should contact the GPC for assistance in drafting an appropriate letter for the student to address those concerns so that the student understands the seriousness and can plan accordingly.** **Please submit this form by email to the student and Lorna Williams lornaw@andrew.cmu.edu.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***Research-related performance*** | Good relative to peers at same stage | Minor concern relative to peers at same stage | Area of significant concern – improvement is essential | Can’t evaluate at this time | Please comment on any items where improvement is important for the student’s professional development and success. **Check if the listed suggestions apply.** |
| Foundation knowledge for research **Related Objective:** Attain background knowledge appropriate for Ph.D.-level research |  |  |  |  | Additional course work neededAttend seminars more oftenRead literature more widely Interact with more group members Other Comments? |
| Work habits (efficiency, persistence, organization, appropriate hours) **Related Objective:** Conduct extended research with increasing independence |  |  |  |  | Shift focus from courses to research Need more hours in lab Other Comments? |
| Producing publishable-quality results **Related Objective:** Make an original contribution to knowledge, and produce material worthy of publication |  |  |  |  | Improvements needed in lab or coding skills |
| Creative and experimental design input  **Related Objective:** Generate ideas for original research in chemistry and defend the methods and importance of the research |  |  |  |  |  |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***Research-related performance*** | Good relative to peers at same stage | Minor concern relative to peers at same stage | Area of significant concern – improvement is essential | Can’t evaluate at this time | Please comment on any items where improvement is important for the student’s professional development and success. **Check if the listed suggestions apply.** |
| Appropriate independence in research  **Related Objective:** Conduct extended research with increasing independence |  |  |  |  |  |
| Appropriate communication with advisor (e.g. initiating meetings, providing summaries of results that help with writing manuscripts, asserting oneself appropriately to move projects forward) **Related Objective:** Conduct extended research with increasing independence |  |  |  |  | Meet formally more often (e.g. broader discussions of research)Initiate communication with advisor more **Other Comments?** |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Communication Skills and Citizenship* | Good relative to most peers at same stage | Minor concern relative to peers at same stage | Area of significant concern | Can’t evaluate at this time | Please comment on any items where improvement is important for the student’s professional development and success. Check if the listed suggestions apply. |
| Writing skills (e.g. drafting results in a timely way, responding effectively to feedback, producing complete manuscripts, producing good quality reports/drafts)  **Related Objective:** Develop professional-level scientific writing skills |  |  |  |  | Take more initiative in writing about your research  Complete a first draft of a manuscript  Work with Global Communication Center (workshops, consultations on initial drafts)  **Other Comments?** |
| Presentation Skills (in group meetings, program requirements, at conferences) – *Please include comments on English fluency where appropriate.* **Related Objective:** Speak effectively to an audience of faculty and peers about chemistry |  |  |  |  | Spend more time at ICC to further improve spoken English  Submit work to an upcoming conference  **Other Comments?** |
| Communication with collaborators (if applicable) |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Communication Skills and Citizenship* | Good relative to most peers at same stage | Minor concern relative to peers at same stage | Area of significant concern | Can’t evaluate at this time | Please comment on any items where improvement is important for the student’s professional development and success. Check if the listed suggestions apply. |
| Mentoring undergraduates in research (if applicable) **Related Objective:** Prepare for teaching and mentoring roles in academia and industry |  |  |  |  |  |
| Teaching (if advisor has worked with the student as a TA or providing mentoring related to teaching) **Related Objective:** Prepare for teaching and mentoring roles in academia and industry |  |  |  |  |  |
| Citizenship in the group -- Please indicate the student’s duties:lab managersafetyorderinginstrument maintenancecomputing liaison other? |  |  |  |  | Be more assertive in handling instrument repair and lab maintenance  Take greater care in maintaining high standards  Show more leadership in the group Other comments? |
| Overall research skills, effectiveness, and productivity **Please provide an overall summary assessment here (check a rating and provide comments).** |  |  |  |  | **Summary comments and suggestions for improvements**  Projection of the graduation semester/year for ABD student: |